

**Planning Committee
29 August 2018**

Irvine, 29 August 2018 - At a Meeting of the Planning Committee of North Ayrshire Council at 2.00 p.m.

Present

Tom Marshall, Timothy Billings, Robert Barr, Robert Foster, Christina Larsen, Ellen McMaster, Ronnie McNicol and Donald Reid.

In Attendance

J. Miller, Senior Manager (Planning) (Economy and Communities); M. Barbour, Solicitor (Legal Services); and E. Gray, Committee Services Officer (Chief Executive's Service).

Chair

Councillor Marshall in the Chair.

Apologies for Absence

Ian Clarkson and Shaun Macaulay

1. Declarations of Interest

In terms of Standing Order 10 and Section 5 of the Code of Conduct, Councillor Billings, as a Council representative on North Ayrshire Leisure Ltd., declared an indirect interest in Agenda Item 4.1 (18/00522/PPM: East Park, Quarry Road, Irvine) and took no part in the decision making process for this item.

2. Minutes

The Minutes of the meeting of the Planning Committee held on 23 May 2018 were confirmed and the Minutes signed in accordance with Paragraph 7 (1) of Schedule 7 of the Local Government (Scotland) Act 1973.

3. Isle of Arran

Submitted reports on the following applications:

3.1 18/00570/PP: Bay News, Whiting Bay, Brodick, Isle Of Arran

Tim Hodgkinson has applied for a change in use from Class 1 (Retail) to Class 2 (Financial & Professional Services), and the removal of condition 1 of a planning permission (ref. 13/00612/PP) to remove an occupancy restriction of an associated dwelling flat and discharge of the Section 75 Agreement at Bay News, Whiting Bay, Brodick, Isle Of Arran.

The Senior Manager (Planning) outlined the terms of the planning report, including narrating the relevant planning history of the site. On 4 August 2009, the Planning Committee agreed to grant planning permission for alterations to the roof of the shop to form a dwelling flat and the erection of a balcony to the rear (ref. 09/00199/PP), subject to the applicants entering into a Section 75 Agreement to limit the occupation of the dwelling flat to the owner or an employee of the retail premises on the ground floor. On 16 May 2014, the Planning Committee agreed to amend the terms of the Section 75 Agreement and condition 1 of planning permission 09/00199/PP to include use of the 1st floor accommodation for holiday letting (ref. 13/00612/PP).

The Committee unanimously agreed to grant the application.

3.2 18/00489/PP: Site to The East Of Linevern Silverhill, Whiting Bay, Brodick, Isle Of Arran

Stuart Heaney has applied for planning permission for road upgrading, the erection of a dwellinghouse and temporary siting of a caravan in the Upper Silverhills area of Whiting Bay. Four letters of objection and three letters of support were received and were detailed in the report.

The Senior Manager (Planning) outlined the terms of the planning report, including narrating that there has been a history of refusals of planning applications for housing development in the Upper Silverhills area, due to concerns over the unsuitability of the road provision in the area.

The Committee unanimously agreed to grant the application subject to the following conditions:-

1. That prior to the commencement of the development hereby approved, the developer shall submit for the written approval of North Ayrshire Council as Planning Authority:
 - Full details and/or sample of the proposed external finishes of the buildings;
 - Full details of the proposed boundary enclosures; and
 - Full details of the proposed drainage scheme for the site.

If approved, the development shall thereafter be completed only in accordance with the approved details, to the satisfaction of North Ayrshire Council as Planning Authority.

2. That prior to the commencement of development the developer shall submit for the written approval of North Ayrshire Council as Planning Authority, full details of the proposed upgrading of the access road and turning hammerhead, as outlined on plan 1704/02-Rev F, hereby approved. For the avoidance of doubt the access road shall be upgraded to an adoptable standard to the satisfaction of North Ayrshire Council as Planning Authority. The access road upgrade shall be completed, prior to the commencement of the development of the dwellinghouse, hereby approved, to the satisfaction of North Ayrshire Council as Planning Authority, unless otherwise agreed in writing, by North Ayrshire Council as Planning Authority.

3. That the first 2 metres of the driveway access shall be hard surfaced in order to prevent loose material being carried onto the carriageway and shall be designed in such a way that no surface water shall issue from the access onto the carriageway, all to the satisfaction of North Ayrshire Council as planning authority.
4. That notwithstanding the details within the approved plans the proposed residential caravan is temporary and shall be removed from the application site by 28th August 2020 or on first occupation of the dwellinghouse hereby approved, whichever occurs first, all to the satisfaction of North Ayrshire Council as planning authority. Details of the resiting of the caravan shall be submitted for the approval in writing of North Ayrshire Council as planning authority.

3.3 18/00542/PP: Plot 3, Greenhill Torbeg, Blackwaterfoot, Brodick, Isle Of Arran

Ms Janet Murchie has applied for planning permission for the erection of a house on a site known as Plot 3 Greenhill in Torbeg, north of Blackwaterfoot. Five letters of objection and 20 letters of support were received and were detailed in the report.

The Senior Manager (Planning) provided details of a representation which had been received following the publication of the agenda and a copy was circulated to Members. This representation highlighted concerns regarding the requirements for a visibility splay to the north of the site, use of the current septic tank and the impact of the development on the skyline.

The Senior Manager (Planning) outlined the terms of the planning report, including narrating the responses detailed in the report, some of which raised similar concerns to the most recent representations.

The Committee was informed of a letter received from the applicant's solicitor advising that the existing north visibility splay is owned by all five plots on a pro-indiviso basis as is the existing access road; meaning that each plot owner owns an equal share in the property which can be sold but which cannot be divided physically. These rights being set out in a Deed of Conditions granted in 1996 and include the following burdens:-

- 1 a condition that all buildings must be drained and sewered via one septic tank;
- 2 a right of an outflow pipe for the 5 plots' septic tank; and
- 3 the right to build 5 houses.

The Senior Manager (Planning) highlighted an amendment to the second recommended condition which should read:-

“That the private road, as detailed on the approved plan 1807/11 to include a passing place and visibility splays of 2.5m by 90m in both directions at the junction with the public road, shall be upgraded to adoptable standard prior to the commencement of the development hereby approved, to the satisfaction of North Ayrshire Council as planning authority, unless otherwise agreed in writing by the planning authority. A road construction consent shall require to be obtained prior to the commencement of the development hereby approved, all to the satisfaction of North Ayrshire Council as planning authority.”

The Committee unanimously agreed to grant the application subject to the following conditions:-

1. That prior to the commencement of the development hereby approved, the developer shall submit for the written approval of North Ayrshire Council as Planning Authority:

- Full details and/or sample of the proposed external finishes of the buildings;
- Full details of the proposed boundary enclosures; and
- Full details of the proposed drainage scheme for the site.

If approved, the development shall thereafter be completed only in accordance with the approved details, all to the satisfaction of North Ayrshire Council as Planning Authority.

2. That the private road, as detailed on the approved plan 1807/11 to include a passing place and visibility splays of 2.5m by 90m in both directions at the junction with the public road, shall be upgraded to adoptable standard prior to the commencement of the development hereby approved, to the satisfaction of North Ayrshire Council as planning authority, unless otherwise agreed in writing by the planning authority. A road construction consent shall require to be obtained prior to the commencement of the development hereby approved, all to the satisfaction of North Ayrshire Council as planning authority.
3. That the first 2 metres of the driveway access shall be hard surfaced in order to prevent loose material being carried onto the carriageway and shall be designed in such a way that no surface water shall issue from the access onto the carriageway, all to the satisfaction of North Ayrshire Council as planning authority.
4. That, for the avoidance of doubt, the detached garage hereby approved shall be used for domestic purposes incidental to the enjoyment of the associated dwellinghouse only and for no other purpose.

3.4 18/00541/PP: Plot 5, Greenhill Torbeg, Blackwaterfoot, Brodick, Isle Of Arran

Mr Donald Murchie applied for planning permission for the erection of a house on Plot 5 Greenhill in Torbeg, north of Blackwaterfoot. Five letters of objection and 20 letters of support were received and were detailed in the report.

The Senior Manager (Planning) provided details of a representation which had been received following the publication of the agenda and a copy was circulated to Members. This representation highlighted concerns regarding the requirements for a visibility splay to the north of the site, use of the current septic tank and the impact of the development on the skyline.

The Senior Manager (Planning) outlined the terms of the planning report, including narrating the responses detailed in the report some of which raised similar concerns to the most recent representations and consideration of these representations.

The Committee were informed of a letter received from the applicant's solicitor advising that the existing north visibility splay is owned by all five plots on a pro-indiviso basis as is the existing access road; meaning that each plot owner owns an equal share in the property which can be sold but which cannot be divided physically. These rights being set out in a Deed of Conditions granted in 1996 and include the following burdens:-

- 1 a condition that all buildings must be drained and sewered via one septic tank;
- 2 a right of an outflow pipe for the 5 plots' septic tank; and
- 3 the right to build 5 houses.

The Senior Manager (Planning) highlighted an amendment to the second recommended condition which should read:-

“That the private road, as detailed on the approved plan 1807/11 to include a passing place and visibility splays of 2.5m by 90m in both directions at the junction with the public road, shall be upgraded to adoptable standard prior to the commencement of the development hereby approved, to the satisfaction of North Ayrshire Council as planning authority, unless otherwise agreed in writing by the planning authority. A road construction consent shall require to be obtained prior to the commencement of the development hereby approved, all to the satisfaction of North Ayrshire Council as planning authority.”

The Committee unanimously agreed to grant the application subject to the following conditions:-

1. That prior to the commencement of the development hereby approved, the developer shall submit for the written approval of North Ayrshire Council as Planning Authority:
 - Full details and/or sample of the proposed external finishes of the buildings;
 - Full details of the proposed boundary enclosures; and
 - Full details of the proposed drainage scheme for the site.

If approved, the development shall thereafter be completed only in accordance with the approved details, all to the satisfaction of North Ayrshire Council as Planning Authority.

2. That the private road, as detailed on the approved plan 1807/11 to include a passing place and visibility splays of 2.5m by 90m in both directions at the junction with the public road, shall be upgraded to adoptable standard prior to the commencement of the development hereby approved, to the satisfaction of North Ayrshire Council as planning authority, unless otherwise agreed in writing by the planning authority. A road construction consent shall require to be obtained prior to the commencement of the development hereby approved, all to the satisfaction of North Ayrshire Council as planning authority.
3. That the first 2 metres of the driveway access shall be hard surfaced in order to prevent loose material being carried onto the carriageway and shall be designed in such a way that no surface water shall issue from the access onto the carriageway, all to the satisfaction of North Ayrshire Council as planning authority.
4. That, for the avoidance of doubt, the detached garage hereby approved shall be used for domestic purposes incidental to the enjoyment of the associated dwellinghouse only and for no other purpose.

4. Irvine

Submitted reports on the following applications:

4.1 18/00522/PPM: East Park, Quarry Road, Irvine

Hub SW/North Ayrshire Council has applied for planning permission for the erection of a building to accommodate an indoor artificial pitch, erection of changing rooms (linked to existing building from phase 1); the formation of an external all-weather sports pitch and three tennis courts, to include associated boundary enclosures; the erection of a storage building; the formation of a 750m cycling loop together with associated car parking provision, SuDs and drainage infrastructure and the demolition of an existing workshop building. Two representations were received and were detailed in the report.

The Committee unanimously agreed to grant the application subject to the following conditions:-

1. That, for the duration of the land engineering and construction operations hereby approved, an area of ground within the site equivalent to the size of an existing full size grass pitch shall be retained for public use at all times, unless otherwise agreed in writing with North Ayrshire Council as Planning Authority..
2. That, prior to the commencement of any land drainage works hereby approved, confirmation shall be submitted in writing to North Ayrshire Council as Planning Authority and certified by a suitably qualified person that a scheme to treat the surface water arising from the site has been prepared in accordance with the principles and practices contained in 'The SuDS Manual' (CIRIA report C753, published November 2015), and that the site would be drained in accordance with the details contained in the submitted Flood Risk Assessment, Drainage Strategy and Landscaping Proposals. Thereafter, the

certified scheme shall be implemented prior to the completion of the development and maintained thereafter to the satisfaction of North Ayrshire Council as Planning Authority.

3. That, prior to commencing the construction of the buildings hereby approved, the applicant/agent shall submit for the written approval of North Ayrshire Council as Planning Authority a detailed schedule of the proposed external finishes to be used.
4. That the presence of any significant unsuspected contamination that becomes evident during the development of the site shall be brought to the attention of Environmental Health. Thereafter a suitable investigation strategy as agreed with North Ayrshire Council shall be implemented and any necessary remediation works carried out prior to any further development taking place on the site, all to the satisfaction of North Ayrshire Council as Planning Authority.

4.2 18/00466/PPM: Dundonald Links, Ayr Road, Irvine

Loch Lomond Golf Club have applied under Section 42 of Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997 to vary conditions 1, 2 and 3 of planning permission in principle ref. 15/00705/PPPM for housing development and visitor accommodation at Dundonald Links Golf Course.

Conditions 1 and 2 of 15/00705/PPPM relate to the timing of submission of technical studies in advance of considering matters specified in conditions application for development. Condition 3 sets out the need for a detailed masterplan and development brief.

The Committee unanimously agreed to grant the application subject to the following conditions:-

1. That along with the submission of the first application for the approval of matters specified in conditions (MSC), a programme of archaeological works in accordance with a written scheme of investigation, the results of which shall inform the layout of the detailed masterplan required by Condition 3, shall be submitted for the approval of North Ayrshire Council as Planning Authority. Thereafter, the developer shall ensure that the approved programme of archaeological works is fully implemented and that all recording and recovery of archaeological resources within the development site is undertaken to the satisfaction of North Ayrshire Council as Planning Authority.
2. That along with the submission of the first application for the approval of matters specified in conditions (MSC) a scheme to treat the surface water arising from the site in accordance with the principles and practices contained in CIRIA's SuDS Manual (C753) (published 11th November 2015), the results of which shall inform the layout of the detailed masterplan required by Condition 3, shall be submitted for the written approval of North Ayrshire Council as Planning Authority. Thereafter, the scheme as may be approved shall be implemented during the course of development and maintained thereafter to the satisfaction of North Ayrshire Council as Planning Authority.

3. That along with the submission of the first application for the approval of matters specified in conditions (MSC), a detailed masterplan for the site and a development brief shall be submitted for the approval of North Ayrshire Council as Planning Authority. The detailed masterplan and development brief shall take into account the findings of the archaeological investigations and the detailed SuDS scheme required by conditions 1 and 2 respectively, and shall indicate:

- the means of access to the site, including multi-user link(s) to public transport at Ayr Road;
- the development layout;
- the housing designs for the development;
- structural landscaping including earthworks to mitigate road noise from the A78 and industry;
- areas of open space;
- areas for children's play and
- phasing.

For the avoidance of doubt, the maximum number of housing units within the development hereby approved shall not exceed 45. In addition, the housing development area shall be limited to the land generally to the south of the replacement clubhouse consented under the terms of planning permission ref. 15/00558/PP.

Thereafter, the details contained in the MSC application(s) shall accord with the detailed masterplan and development brief as may be approved, to the satisfaction of North Ayrshire Council as Planning Authority.

4. That the approval of North Ayrshire Council as Planning Authority with regard to the siting, design and external appearance of, landscaping, means of access to the proposed development and affordable housing contribution shall be obtained before the development is commenced.
5. That application(s) for the approval of matters specified in conditions (MSC) shall include details of the noise mitigation measures in accordance with PAN 1/2011 'Planning and Noise' and the associated Technical Advice Note (TAN) - 'Assessment of Noise'. The assessment shall take into account all noise related details contained in the consultation response of Environmental Health dated 9th December 2015. Thereafter, the findings arising from the noise impact assessment as may be approved shall be implemented prior to any of the houses being occupied to the satisfaction of North Ayrshire Council as Planning Authority.
6. That application(s) for the approval of matters specified in conditions (MSC) shall include measures to implement the findings and recommendations of the Extended Phase 1 Habitat Survey prepared by Energised Environments Ltd dated October 2015. Thereafter, the development shall be implemented only in accordance with the measures as may be approved unless North Ayrshire Council as Planning Authority gives written consent to any variation.

7. That application(s) for the approval of matters specified in conditions (MSC) shall include a biodiversity action plan, which shall include details of bat hibernacula, bird boxes, wildflowers and other measures to promote/safeguard biodiversity and nature conservation. Thereafter, the action plan as may be approved shall be implemented prior to the completion or occupation of the development, whichever is the sooner, to the satisfaction of North Ayrshire Council as Planning Authority.
8. That visibility splays of 4.5m x 215m shall be provided and maintained on land within the applicant's control, such that there is no obstruction to visibility above a height of 1.05 metre measured above the adjacent carriageway level to the satisfaction of North Ayrshire Council as Planning Authority.
9. That, prior to the commencement of the development, hereby approved, full details of proposed treeworks and tree protection measures for the development shall be submitted for the written approval of North Ayrshire Council as Planning Authority. The details shall comply with the principles and practices contained in "BS 5837:2012 - Trees in relation to design, demolition and construction - Recommendations." Detailed plans indicating tree protection fencing to be erected, an Arboricultural Impact Assessment and an Arboricultural Method Statement shall be submitted for written approval. For the avoidance of doubt:
 - there shall be no treeworks undertaken during the main bird breeding season (March - September);
 - all tree protection measures to be erected shall be maintained in a satisfactory condition for the duration of all engineering and construction operations until the completion of the development.

The development shall be implemented only in accordance with such details as may be approved to the satisfaction of North Ayrshire Council as Planning Authority.

10. That, during the implementation of the development hereby approved, all recommendations contained within the report titled "Residential Development - Dundonald Links, Geo-Environmental Desk Study Report" by Fairhurst, Report No. 111895 and dated November 2015 shall be implemented to the satisfaction of North Ayrshire Council as Planning Authority.
11. That the presence of any significant unsuspected contamination that becomes evident during the development of the site shall be brought to the attention of Environmental Health. Thereafter a suitable investigation strategy as agreed with North Ayrshire Council shall be implemented and any necessary remediation works carried out prior to any further development taking place on the site, all to the satisfaction of North Ayrshire Council as Planning Authority.
12. That the clubhouse, as previously approved under the terms of planning permission ref. 18/00465/PP, shall be erected to the satisfaction of North Ayrshire Council as Planning Authority prior to the commencement of the housing development hereby approved, unless otherwise agreed in writing.

5. North Coast and Cumbraes

Submitted reports on the following applications:

5.1 18/00518/PP: 48 Gallowgate Street, Largs

Stephen McDonald has applied for the extension of an outdoor seating area (in retrospect) at 48 Gallowgate Street, Largs. Three letters of support and one letter of support were received and were detailed in the report.

The Senior Manager (Planning) provided details of three further representations (two objections and one of support) which were received following the publication of the agenda and copies were circulated to members. The objections raised concerns around expanding areas for the sale of alcohol and size of the seating area. The letter of support was concerned with supporting jobs and businesses in the area.

The Committee unanimously agreed to grant the application subject to the following conditions:-

1. That the seating area shall at all times be enclosed by a suitably designed removable barrier, full details of which shall be submitted for the written approval of North Ayrshire Council as Planning Authority. For the avoidance of doubt no artificial lighting or individually sited heating systems shall be provided within the outdoor seating area.
2. That the maximum permitted hours of operation of the outdoor seating area shall be between 1100 and 2100 hours on any day unless otherwise agreed in writing by North Ayrshire Council as Planning Authority. The seating together with any tables, umbrellas, associated posts and barriers shall be removed from the square outwith these hours and at all times when the premises are closed to customers.

5.2 18/00393/PPPM: Site To South East Of 41 Tarbert Avenue, West Kilbride

Robert McMillan has applied for planning permission in principle for residential development of the site to the south east of 41 Tarbert Avenue, West Kilbride. Seven letters of objection were received and were detailed in the report.

The Committee unanimously agreed to grant the application subject to the following conditions:-

1. That prior to the submission of the first application for the approval of matters specified in conditions (MSC), a programme of archaeological works in accordance with a written scheme of investigation, the results of which shall inform the layout of the detailed masterplan required by Condition 3, shall be submitted for the approval of North Ayrshire Council as Planning Authority. Thereafter, the developer shall ensure that the approved programme of archaeological works is fully implemented and that all recording and recovery

of archaeological resources within the development site is undertaken to the satisfaction of North Ayrshire Council as Planning Authority.

2. That prior to the submission of the first application for the approval of matters specified in conditions (MSC), a water and drainage assessment shall be for the approval of North Ayrshire Council as Planning Authority which actions all relevant recommendations of the Flood Risk Assessment. The water and drainage assessment shall demonstrate that:
 - (i) the development will not be at high medium or low likelihood of flooding or will increase the likelihood of flooding elsewhere;
 - (ii) run-off to the site from adjacent steeply sloping ground shall be intercepted and appropriately attenuated and treated before discharging to the water environment or to a suitable piped system;
 - (iii) in the event that surface water will discharge to the existing culvert at the site's Western edge, there would be no notable negative impact in terms of flood risk and water quality; and,
 - (iv) full details of the parties responsible for the maintenance of all drainage assets are provided in a suitably detailed plan and that all associated maintenance operations are identified on an accompanying schedule.

The water and drainage assessment shall detail a scheme to treat the surface water arising from the site in accordance with the principles and practices contained in CIRIA's SuDS Manual (C753) (published 11th November 2015), the results of which shall inform the layout of the detailed masterplan required by Condition 3. Thereafter, the scheme as may be approved shall be implemented during the course of development and maintained thereafter to the satisfaction of North Ayrshire Council as Planning Authority.

3. Prior to the commencement of development on site, a further application(s) for the approval of the matters specified in this condition (MSC) must be submitted to and approved by North Ayrshire Council as Planning Authority. These matters are as follows:
 - (a) the layout of the site, including all roads, footways, shared paths, car parking areas, and open spaces;
 - (b) the siting, design and external appearance of all building(s) and any other structures, including plans and elevations showing their dimensions and type and colour of external materials;
 - (c) a detailed flood risk assessment, including cross-sections of existing and proposed ground levels, details of under-building and finished floor levels in relation to a fixed datum, preferably ordnance datum, and detailing how flood issues are addressed.
 - (d) the means of drainage and surface water strategy and methodology for sewage disposal, including Sustainable Urban Drainage Systems (SUDS), all set out in a comprehensive Drainage Assessment, including maintenance. Such SUDS shall be self-certified by a suitably qualified person;
 - (e) the means of access to the site including an updated Transport Strategy;
 - (f) the design and location of all boundary treatments including walls and fences;

- (g) the landscaping and associated maintenance proposals for the site, including details of existing trees, hedgerows and other planting to be retained and tree protection measures together with proposals for new planting specifying number, size and species of all trees and shrubs and a woodland management implementation programme;
- (h) details of the phasing of development (covering all relevant aspects of development detailed in (a) above);
- (i) a design and access statement with the design issues addressed in the formulation of the proposals, set out in line with the relevant supplementary design guidance approved by North Ayrshire Council.

For the avoidance of doubt the illustrative masterplan provided with this application is not approved. The layout of the site shall take into account archaeological investigations, the detailed SuDS scheme, water and drainage assessments required by conditions 1 and 2 respectively, and shall take into account the principles of the Scottish Government's 'Designing Streets' and 'Designing Places' policy documents to the satisfaction of North Ayrshire Council as Planning Authority.

5.3 18/00315/PP: Site To North Of Seaview Caravan Park, Ardrossan Road, Seamill

Iain McClain has applied for the formation of extension to Seaview Caravan Park, Ardrossan Road, Seamill. 14 letters of support were received and were detailed in the report.

The Senior Manager (Planning) highlighted an amendment to the second recommended condition which should read:-

“That the site shall only be used as a caravan site for non-permanent occupation for holiday or tourism use only to the satisfaction of North Ayrshire Council as Planning Authority.”

Councillor Barr, seconded by Councillor McNicol, moved that the application be granted with no conditions.

As an amendment, Councillor Reid, seconded by Councillor Foster, moved that the application be granted subject to the conditions set out in the report.

On a division, there voted for the amendment six and for the motion two and the amendment was declared carried.

Accordingly, the Committee agreed to grant the application subject to the following conditions:-

1. That prior to the commencement of development the developer shall ensure that all planting and seeding, comprised in approved drawing LS01, shall be carried out in the first planting season and seeding seasons to the satisfaction of North Ayrshire Council as Planning Authority. Any trees or plants which, within a period of five years from the completion of the development die, are removed or become seriously damaged or diseased shall be replaced in the

next planting season with others of a similar size and species, unless North Ayrshire Council as Planning Authority gives written consent to any variation. For the avoidance of doubt, the trees and planting shall be protected with fencing during the construction of the development.

2. That the site shall only be used as a caravan site for non-permanent occupation for holiday or tourism use only to the satisfaction of North Ayrshire Council as Planning Authority.

The meeting ended at 3:30 p.m.